

Negotiation Guide

*After examining the facts used in your side of the argument, look at the facts both sides use from a different perspective. What **interests** drive the use of these facts?*

ex. Immigration from 1925 to 1965 averaged 178,000 per year. Now, we're taking in approximately 1.1 million legal immigrants and up to 700,000 illegal aliens annually.

We want to limit skyrocketing US population.

1. Under current policy, U.S. population will double this century - practically within the lifetimes of today's children - and will continue to grow.

2. In 1995, only 5% of legal immigrants were skilled workers.

3. Approximately 52% of immigrant families earn less than two times the official poverty level. Nearly 20% of immigrant-headed households in Colorado receive some form of welfare benefit.

4. The Population Reference Bureau projects the U.S. will add 140 million people to its population between 2002 and 2050, thus increasing the population of the U.S from 287 million to 420 million.²

5. As for legal status, we estimate that the birth rate of illegal alien women was 3.1 children on average in 2002, or about 50 percent higher than the two children natives have on average. The birth rate for legal immigrants is 2.6, or about one-third higher than that of natives.³

6. The National Academy of Sciences found the net fiscal drain on American taxpayers is \$166-226 per year for each native household. Even studies showing modest economic gain from immigration (\$1-10 billion per year) find it is outweighed by the fiscal cost of \$15-20 billion per year.⁴

7. Americans who have lost jobs haven't lost them to immigrants, but to corporations that have taken their factories overseas for cheaper labor.

² This entire list of facts was taken word-for-word from: CAIR – Colorado Alliance for Immigration Reform. Available at <http://www.cairco.org>

³ Center for Immigration Studies. Available at <http://www.cis.org/articles/2005/back1105.html>

⁴ Ibid

8. Immigrants start small businesses more often than the native born population and create new jobs and revenue for the US
9. Immigrants boost national economic growth
10. Immigrants offer diversification that is healthy in the US
11. 96% of undocumented men living in the U.S. are employed
12. Undocumented immigrants fill job gaps Americans don't want to do.
13. Undocumented immigrants pay some taxes like income and sales tax. According to La Raza "the majority of undocumented immigrants pay income taxes using Individual Taxpayer Identification Numbers (ITINs) or false Social Security numbers. All immigrants, regardless of status, will pay on average \$80,000 per capita more in taxes than they use in government services over their lifetime" ⁵
14. Social Security Administration says it holds about \$420 billion from earnings of immigrants who are not in a position to claim benefits" ⁶
15. Undocumented immigrants are ineligible for most welfare benefits. "As a result, health care spending for immigrants is approximately half that of citizens" ⁷

⁵ National Coalition of La Raza, "Common Myths about Undocumented Immigrants." Available at <http://www.nclr.org/content/publications/download/38093>

⁶ Ibid

⁷ Ibid

<i>Now prepare for negotiation. Remember:</i>
1. Focus on your interests. What do you want in the end? Don't let your position drive the discussion.
2. Listen to the other side. Try to understand where they are coming from.
3. Find common ground. What are your options? How can you find a win / win solution that meets both party's interests?

During the simulation you will be graded on your ability to listen and contribute respectfully to the discussion. Make sure you ask clarifying questions of the other side so that they know you are listening and so that you are sure you understand where they're coming from. Take notes on what the other side says. Write down anything you seem to have in common.

Comment:	made by:

Common ground:

After you have presented your interests and discussed some possible solutions, break into your identity groups for a ten-minute break. Discuss the following in your groups:

Our interests:	Common Ground:	Their interests:

Identity: Anti-immigration activist

Position: We want to cap immigration and expel all illegal aliens

Interests: We are worried about overpopulation and the loss of American jobs and money to foreign-born workers.

Values: We believe that every nation has the right to control its borders.

Arguments:

- Under current policy, U.S. population will double this century - practically within the lifetimes of today's children - and will continue to grow.

- In 1995, only 5% of legal immigrants were skilled workers.

A new report by the Center for Immigration Studies concludes that over **33 million legal immigrants and illegal aliens now live in the United States, an increase of 2 million immigrants since the recent April 2000 Census.**

- The Population Reference Bureau projects the U.S. will add 140 million people to its population between 2002 and 2050, thus increasing the population of the U.S from 287 million to 420 million.⁸

- As for legal status, we estimate that the birth rate of illegal alien women was 3.1 children on average in 2002, or about 50 percent higher than the two children natives have on average. The birth rate for legal immigrants is 2.6, or about one-third higher than that of natives.⁹

- We have previously estimated from birth records that there were 380,000 births to illegal aliens in 2002, accounting for nearly 10 percent of all births in the United States.¹⁰

- New immigrants (legal and illegal) plus births to immigrants add some 2.3 million people to the United States each year, accounting for most of the nation's population increase.¹¹

- Colorado spends \$50 million per year educating immigrant children from Mexico alone. This will require 5,000 new teachers to be hired annually and building 20 new schools annually. The Rocky Mountain News reported construction and renovation would cost \$165-175 million.¹²

- Approximately 52% of immigrant families earn less than two times the official poverty level. Nearly 20% of immigrant-headed households in Colorado receive some form of welfare benefit.

- The National Academy of Sciences found the net fiscal drain on American taxpayers is \$166-226 per year for each native household. Even studies showing modest economic gain from immigration (\$1-10 billion per year) find it is outweighed by the fiscal cost of \$15-20 billion per year.¹³

- 1,880,000 American workers are displaced from their jobs by immigration. The cost for providing welfare and assistance to displaced Americans is over \$15 billion/year.¹⁴

⁸ The first four facts were quoted directly from: CAIR – Colorado Alliance for Immigration Reform. Available at <http://www.cairco.org>

⁹ Center for Immigration Studies. Available at <http://www.cis.org/articles/2005/back1105.html>

¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹ Ibid

¹² CAIR – Colorado Alliance for Immigration Reform. Available at <http://www.cairco.org>

¹³ Ibid

¹⁴ Ibid

Identity: Pro-immigration activists

Position: We want an open immigration policy

Interests: We believe that immigration is good for the United States economically, culturally, and philosophically.

Values: We believe that diversity is a strength. We also believe that much of the anti-immigration movement is fueled by racism.

Arguments:

- Americans who have lost jobs haven't lost them to immigrants, but to corporations that have taken their factories overseas for cheaper labor.
- American "progress" – its wealth is based on globalization, which in turn often profits from the --- of third world workers.
- Immigrants start small businesses more often than native-born populations and create new jobs and revenue for the US
- Immigrants boost national economic growth
- Immigrants offer diversification that is healthy in the US
- 96% of undocumented men living in the U.S. are employed
- Undocumented immigrants fill job gaps Americans don't want to do.
- Undocumented immigrants pay some taxes like income and sales tax. According to "the majority of undocumented immigrants pay income taxes using Individual Taxpayer Identification Numbers (ITINs) or false Social Security numbers. All immigrants, regardless of status, will pay on average \$80,000 per capita more in taxes than they use in government services over their lifetime"¹⁵
- Social Security Administration says it holds about \$420 billion from earnings of immigrants who are not in a position to claim benefits"¹⁶
- Undocumented immigrants are ineligible for most welfare benefits. "As a result, health care spending for immigrants is approximately half that of citizens"¹⁷

¹⁵ National Coalition of La Raza, "Common Myths about Undocumented Immigrants." Available at <http://www.nclr.org/content/publications/download/38093>

¹⁶ Ibid

¹⁷ Ibid

